

## QUALIFICATION COMMISSION

Minutes of Meeting at 82<sup>nd</sup> Congress, Krakow, 2011

Session 1            16.10.2011 10am

### Chairman's opening remarks

Mikko Markkula (MM) said that the agenda fell into two parts. First, there were matters upon which decisions were required in Krakow. Second, a full review of all regulations was scheduled for the 2012 meeting in Istanbul, with changes to take effect from 1<sup>st</sup> July 2013, and the QC should commence discussion of this. The councillors had already held a preliminary two day meeting in London, where they had agreed recommendations regarding most of the matters in the first group. The minutes of that meeting formed the basis for the agenda of this meeting, with their numbering.

1.1 and 2.1 Discussion of title applications awarded, or pending approval, since Khanty-Mansiysk was deferred to the second session.

1.2 Chess in Schools ratings. No proposal has been received from CIS, so there was nothing to discuss.

1.3 Future FIDE Rating System. Nick Faulks (NF) presented an update on progress regarding the Kaggle competition to search for fundamental improvements to the Elo rating system. There is likely to be a meeting in Athens in January 2012 at which a version of the Glicko system will be formally presented.

2.2 1.42f leads to unclear cases, for instance when there are unplayed games. In view of the possible complications, some must be decided on an individual basis. It was reiterated that if a player would be unable to gain a norm by playing to the end of an event, then he may not obtain that norm from a part of that event.

2.3 3-1-0 and other alternative methods of scoring. These may be considered to infringe the conditions required for a tournament to be allowed for ratings and title norms. The view of the meeting was that these forms are not intrinsically unfair, and that they should for the time being be considered valid for rating and title norm purposes. This must be monitored closely, which means that we must as a matter of urgency add this information to all tournament registrations and reports.

2.4 MM presented his recommendations regarding current applications ( attached ). The case of the Toluca tournament, which was played to an unacceptable time control, was discussed at length. Allan Herbert explained that, after the late change to the dates of the World Cup, the event was arranged in a rush and this was the only time control that could be managed. There was general

agreement that any fault lay with the organisers rather than the players, and that some penalties might be appropriate in such circumstances.

A vote was taken the question of whether title norms from the Toluca tournament should be accepted. It was RESOLVED that they SHOULD NOT BE ACCEPTED, by 4 votes to 1, with 2 abstentions.

3.1.1 Direct Titles. NF has produced a discussion document, to be presented in the second session.

3.1.2 CM titles. The Matlin case was discussed. It was RESOLVED that her title be RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL, by 6 votes to 1, with 1 abstention.

3.2 GM / IM titles, change of rating floor. The request that this matter be discussed had been withdrawn.

3.3 Regulations in force at time of old norm results. These remain a problem. MM has many relevant papers, but these are difficult to codify. We also need better historical rating lists. Sevan Muradian suggested that, starting at 1.7.2013, title applications based on norms more than ten years old should be subject to substantially higher fees. This concept met with universal enthusiasm, and will be considered for the next regulation changes.

The meeting adjourned at 1.15pm.

Session 2                      18.10.2011    5pm

3.4 Rates of Play. The meeting was reminded that it was confirmed at the councillors's meeting in London that tournaments using Bronstein mode could produce valid title norms up to 1<sup>st</sup> September 2011, and such applications would then cease, pending possible future changes in the Title Regulations. This is agreed and understood by the organisers and officials who are known to be affected by this issue.

There is a separate issue regarding tournaments in which not all players use the same time control in certain rounds, in apparent breach of Regulation 1.11. It was proposed that norms from these events should be accepted until 1.7.2013, Regulation 1.11 notwithstanding. The vote was tied 4-4, on the Chairman's casting vote the proposal was APPROVED.

3.5 Removal of Players from Rating List. There are two separate issues. Federations have the right to remove home players from the FIDE Rating List for disciplinary reasons. This is a matter beyond the control of the QC, but the Commission has deep concerns regarding this practice, and requests that the issue be discussed at the next meeting of the Presidential Board.

There is also a problem with players who leave their home country, and as a result their home federation, and find themselves stateless. This a more practical difficulty, and will be discussed with Elista.

3.6/7 No Service Federations. Players from these federations still have their ratings, but they cannot be found on the published list. The tournament organiser has to ask FIDE to provide this information in order to accept the player, and it was agreed that a fee of 50 euros, payable to FIDE, would be appropriate.

3.8 Unregistered Players. These sometimes get registered to the wrong federation when entering their first tournament. MM will work with Nigel Freeman and the Elista office to find a solution.

3.9 Banned players. No QC decision required.

3.11 Late applications. The discussion extended to late submission of tournament registrations and results. The next regulation revisions should include higher fees in these cases, twice the normal fee was felt appropriate.

4 and 5 Matters for the future. Discussion was deferred.

1.1, 2.1 MM presented his information and recommendations, following consultation with other commission members, regarding titles approved and in abeyance since Khanty-Mansiysk. These are attached.

6. Rapid and Blitz Ratings. NF presented the proposals which emerged from the councillors' meeting in London. After lively discussion, these were accepted in full as a reasonable framework, and Elista will now be consulted regarding their implementation. The FIDE Treasurer confirmed that there would be no rating fees levied on these events for at least the year of 2012. The Commission thanked him for this constructive and vital offer. These are attached.

7. Other business.

World Girls Invitational. This tournament has been approved by the Presidential Board, and the organisers ask that a WFM title be awarded to the winner of the gold medal. NF proposed that, in view of the imposing title of the event, this was quite reasonable, and that WCM titles for the winners of the silver and bronze medals should be added. This proposal was agreed as the QC's recommendation.

Israel Chess Federation. There has been a request for FIDE to take over the administration of that federation's national rating list. We believe that, if they needed only to consider games which conform to FIDE's rating requirements, this is something which Elista could easily handle, for a fee to be negotiated. If, as it appears, they also need to rate games between unrated opponents, the framework must be discussed, as well as the question of how, or whether, these players can appear in the main list. We shall reply along those lines, with a view to more detailed discussions.

Regulation 6.41. The minor change set out in the minutes of the London meeting was agreed, and will be made immediately as a clarification.

Proposal from Hal Bond. Some Canadian tournaments wish to try out a system whereby amateur entrants in Swiss events can pay an additional fee to guarantee a GM opponent in the first round.

This was accepted as an experiment, to be monitored carefully, with all games rated and all players except those involved in such games free to earn valid norms.

This concluded the matters which required attention in Krakow. Owing to pressure of time, preliminary discussions of the major items which must be decided in 2012 was deferred to future meetings.

MM thanked all members and observers for their valuable contributions. SR thanked the Chairman and Secretary for their efforts.

The meeting was closed at 7.30pm.