



FIDE ETHICS COMMISSION

MINUTES OF MEETINGS

BATUMI, OCTOBER 2018

Dear Mr Deputy President, members of the Presidential Board, members of FIDE Commissions and delegates of member federations,

Supplementary report (minutes)

The Ethics Commission (EC) has already submitted its report covering its activities since the meeting of the Executive Board in Antalya in October 2017 until the present – see **Annex 22**.

The present minutes deal with the activity and decisions of the EC at the Batumi Congress on 28 & 30 September 2018.

Open meeting, 28 September 2018

The EC had a report-back session on 28 September 2018 from 9:25 until 10:25.

The following members of the EC were present:

F Strydom (chairman), I Dobronauteanu, W Iclicki, R Joshi and P Dominguez.

Apologies were received from Elli Sperdokli who could not attend the Congress.

According to the attendance register, the following delegates / interested persons were present:

B. Labadie (CAN), V. Tsy-pin (CAN), W. Kastner (AUT), A Schuering (NED), N. Ali Elhaj (FIDE), A. Vardapetyan (ARM), P. Pisk (CZE), D. Cross (POR), L. Mazouz

(FIDE), A. Burstein (ISR), N. Avdiu (KS), G. Wastell (AUS), A. Muhsin (MAS), N. Faulks (BER), A.N. Yazici (TUR), C. Meyer (USA), S.S. Uddin (BAN), K. Vatanov (TJK), K. Turdialiev (UZB), R. Smith (TTO), A. Abbas (SYR), I. Babu Odiah (KEN), H. Bond (CAN), M. Huba (SVK), A. Shulman (ISR), G. Delhaes (BEL), M. Slav (ISR), S. Yedael (ISR), P. van Hoolandt (MNC), A. Priest (USA), S. Tserendorj (MGL), J-M. Pechine (Organising Committee), R. Ricca (ITA), N Short (ENG).

The EC chairman explained the *modus operandi* of the commission and dealt with most of the activities mentioned in the EC's main report (Annex 22). Some questions were received from the floor and answered, but there was no in-depth discussion of any kind.

Hearing in case 5/2018

An oral hearing in case 5/2018 (Serbian Chess Federation) took place on 28 September 2018 from 10:45 until 19:15 (8 hours 30 min).

During the initial phase, dealing with various interlocutory applications, the meeting was open and apart from the persons directly involved in the hearing (see hereunder) presumably most of the persons present at the EC report-back meeting remained in attendance.

At the beginning of dealing with the motion to exclude Mr Makropoulos from direct participation in the hearing, and at the request of Mr Dvorkovich, the meeting was closed with only persons having a direct interest in the matter allowed to remain present. These were:

Parties: Georgios Makropoulos (complainant), Arkady Dvorkovich (respondent) and Dusan Cogoljevic (respondent).

Counsel / advisors: Luc Pittet (Counsel for Mr Makropoulos), Ioannis Makropoulos (advisor to Mr Makropoulos), Georgi Gradev (Counsel for Mr. Dvorkovich), Yury Zaitsev (Counsel for Mr. Dvorkovich), Alexander Martynov (Counsel for Mr. Dvorkovich).

Witnesses: Boris Kutin, Miodrag Rakic (by telephone), Goran Urosevic, Rajai Al-Susi and Dusan Cogoljevic.

At the end of the proceedings, the EC reserved its judgment and adjourned the meeting.

MEMBERS: *Chairman* - Francois Strydom (RSA), Ion-Serban Dobronauteanu (ROU), Pedro Dominguez Brito (DOM), Willy Iclicki (LIE), Rajesh Hari Joshi (NEP)

Closed meeting, 30 September 2018

The EC met on 30 September 2018 from 14:00 until 18:00 to deliberate on its decision in case 5/2018 and discuss other cases and complaints.

Present were: F Strydom (chairman), I Dobronauteanu, W Iclicki, R Joshi and P Dominguez (save that W Iclicki was absent during the discussions on case 5/2018).

The EC's written decision in case 5/2018 was released to the FIDE Secretariat during the course of the meeting and immediately published on the FIDE website.

The EC noted the following registered cases were uncompleted and carried forward to the EC in its new composition after the elections:

- Case 5/2016 General Assembly, Baku / Bulgaria
- Case 4/2018 Efstratios Grivas / Mongolia
- Case 6/2018 Georgios Makropoulos / Arkady Dvorkovich & Others
- Case 7/2018 Arkady Dvorkovich & Others / Georgios Makropoulos

The EC noted the following complaints received and carried forward to the EC in its new composition after the elections:

- Gabriel Mirza / Irish Chess Union (appeal pending in national federation)
- Tlhoriso Morienyane / Seliso Motloheloa & Lewis Ncube (Lesotho)(received 4 Augustus 2018)
- Frida Gonzalez / Antonio Carmona (Mexico)(received 13 August 2018)
- Mohamed Maali / Jordan Chess Federation (received 20 September 2018)
- Arab Chess Federation / Tahar Battikh (Tunisia)(received 26 September 2018)
- Berik Balgabaev / Georgios Makropoulos (received 27 September 2018)
- Philippe Chatelain / Jorge Vega (Haiti)(received 30 September 2018)

Batumi, 2 October 2018

The Chairman of the Ethics Commission
Francois Strydom